

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: FEBRUARY 12, 2015

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, February 12, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Commissioner James Robinson, Chair, Commissioner Robert Braddock, Vice-Chair, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal, Member. Commission Staff in attendance were Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant HR Director, Ms. Seeta Martindale, Civil Service Recording Secretary, Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst, Mr. Bruce Ross, Human Resources Analyst, Ms. Erica Burks, Human Resources Analyst, Ms. Doris Adotey, Human Resources Analyst, Mr. Derrick Gentry, Human Resources Analyst, and Mr. Nosakhare Ekhatior, Human Resources Analyst.

### AGENDA ITEMS

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 1/22/2015 MEETING.** Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Braddock seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:**

**Janice Yarbrough to the position of Accounting Technician 3 in the Department of Finance/Treasury Division.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Kevin Browning to the position of Clerk Typist 3 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Julie Smith to the position of Clerk Typist 3 in the Police Department.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The candidate is a current City employee in a lower classification. Based on the circumstances, the union and City agreed to waive the 12-month rule. However, this is an appointment from an open eligible list and is not classified as a promotion. The Commission approved this item.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive**

**Jennifer Richmond to the position of Treatment Supervisor in the Department of Sewers/Division of Industrial Waste.** This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills needed by the department, and was selected from among the

**MINUTES cont'd...**

qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional and specialized nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Kirsten Jordan to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department.** This position was posted as a non-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the specific skills needed by the department, and is licensed as a Registered Nurse with the State of Ohio Board of Nursing. This candidate was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work and the specific licensure requirement, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Brandi Sanders to the position of Human Resources Analyst in the Human Resources Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the exceptional appointment process of this item. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the specific skills needed by the department, has demonstrated the additional characteristics required to serve as a confidential employee, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion**

**Sharon Wiehe to the position of Administrative Technician in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Maya Williams to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Health Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Jason Davis to the position of Cement Finisher in the Public Services Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Lonzine Nelms, Douglas Foggie and Ricardo Cook to the position of Sanitation Specialists in the Public Services Department.** This position was posted as an Article XX promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, were referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Vanessa Pleasant, Woodrow Chapman Jr. and Adrian Cook to the position of Water Works Maintenance Workers in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as an Article XX promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, were referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Brian Bolte to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Dean Chatman to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Howard Grant to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Jessie Olverson to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Lakisha Gross to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Nathan Asbury to the position of Police Sergeant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Amanda Spellman to the position of Police Lieutenant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Danita Pettis to the position of Police Lieutenant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Dennis Swingley to the position of Police Lieutenant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**Mark Burns to the position of Police Lieutenant in the Police Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, competed and earned a passing score on the exam, was referred to the department and selected by rank order within the guidelines of the collective bargaining agreement of the Fraternal Order of Police (FOP) contract. The Commission noted this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer**

**Alexandria White to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers.** The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers. This candidate was selected, based on the CODE contract, from among the applicants interested, due to her background in the specific areas needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Bobbi Hageman to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers.** The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers. This candidate was selected, based on the CODE contract, from among the applicants interested, due to her background in the specific areas needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Christine Grimmelsman to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist (Regional Asset Verification and Emergency Network) in the Police Department.** The Police Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Administrative Specialist (Regional Asset Verification and Emergency Network) within its department. This candidate was selected, based on the CODE contract, from among the applicants interested, due to her previous experience in the specific system/equipment needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Jamie Breitenbach to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water.** The Department of Sewers provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Water. This candidate was selected, based on the CODE contract, from among the applicants interested due to specific skills that fill the needs of the department. The Commission noted this item.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Karla Williams to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers.** The City Manager's Office/Communications Center provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Department of Sewers. This candidate was selected, based on the CODE contract, from among the applicants interested due to specific skills that fill the needs of the department. The Commission noted this item

**Tiffany Glenn-Lawrence to the position of Senior Accountant in the Fire Department.** The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Senior Accountant in the Fire Department. This candidate met the minimum requirements of the position and was selected, based on the CODE contract, and experience similar in nature to the duties of the Senior Accountant classification specification. Both parties were agreeable to the transfer. The Commission noted this item

**Angel Strayhorn to the position of Accounting Technician 3 in the Fire Department.** The Human Resources Department provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Accounting Technician 3 in the Fire Department. This candidate met the minimum requirements of the position and was selected based on experience similar in nature to the duties of the Senior Accountant classification specification. Both parties were agreeable to the transfer. The Commission noted this item

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working Out of Class**

**Douglas Robinson to the position of Finance Manager (Purchasing Agent) in the Department of Finance/Purchasing Division.** This candidate was selected, within the guidelines of the CODE contract, to work out of class in the position of Finance Manager (Purchasing Agent). The candidate met the qualifications of this position and is the only employee in the employing unit/division with the specific skills and required experience to fulfill the current needs of the department. The Commission noted this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Promotion Without Exam.**

**Donte Hankerson to the position of Accounting Technician 2 in the Department of Sewers.** The candidate met the minimum requirements of the position and was selected for promotion based on Civil Service Rule 10 § 9, as he possessed the required peculiar and exceptional qualifications needed by the department. Based on the specific needs of the department, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the promotion without exam.

**ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval:**

- a) Police Officer (Lateral Entry) - Open Exam
- b) Police Lieutenant - Promotional Exam
- c) Senior Customer Relations Representative - Promotional Exam
- d) Truck Driver - Promotional Exam
- e) Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor - Promotional Exam

The Commission approved the above items, pending an addition to the Police Officer (Lateral Entry) Open Exam Eligible List.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Request from Granada Williams to appeal her removal from the Truck Driver Eligible List.** Ms. Williams appeared before the Commission accompanied by Mr. Jeremy Triggs, Mr. Robert Stewart, and Mr. Rodney Pennington to speak on the same matter and to attest to the information provided them in relation to future testing and step-up opportunities by Mr. Chris Callahan, Supervisor at the Public Services Department. Mr. Derrick Gentry, Human Resources Analyst was also present. The Commission heard their comments, noted their concerns, and advised that in accordance with Civil Service Rules and collective bargaining agreement guidelines, that an applicant must have completed probation and also not be barred by a 12-month rule or other restriction, in order to sit for a promotional examination. The Commission denied the request.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Exam Schedules**

- a) Automotive Mechanic exam

The Commission approved this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners**

- a. Gloria Malcom for the Wastewater Collection Inspector exam
- b. Tom Goodman and Ken Stith for the Electrical Maintenance Worker 3 exam
- c. Gail Long-Cook and Antonio Young for the Senior Sanitarian exam
- d. Jennifer McCune, Joyce Bryd, Tya Grengbondai and Trin Levins for the Senior Information and Technology Coordinator exam (Board of Education)
- e. Jennifer Bailey, Carol Smith and Lunette Baldwin for the Senior Accounting Technician and Intermediate Accounting Technician exams (Board of Education)

The Commission approved these items.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for approval from the Board of Education for exam revision and re-administration**

- a) The Board of Education is requesting to revise and re-administer the Level 1A Building Engineer examination

The Commission approved this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for approval to allow Equipment Dispatcher II Employees to take Open-Competitive Examinations**

- a) The Department of Public Services is requesting approval to permit the classification of Equipment Dispatcher II to take open-competitive examinations that allow advancement opportunities

The Commission approved this item.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications**

- a) Director of Economic Inclusion
- b) Parks/Recreation Maintenance Crew Leader
- c) Senior Buyer

**MINUTES cont'd...**

- d) Departments of Water and Sewers Deputy Director (Chief Engineer)
- e) Fire Recruit/Fire Fighter
- f) **Board of Education Classification Specifications:**
  - Level I Building Engineer
  - Level IA Building Engineer
  - Level II Building Engineer
  - Level II Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Chiller Technician
  - Level II Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Controls Technician
  - Level II HVAC Technician
  - Automotive Mechanic Foreman
  - Refrigeration Technician
  - Alarm Installer and Repairman

The Commission approved these items.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:**

- a) **City Manager's Office/Budget and Evaluation Division:** Add (2) Administrative Specialist
- b) **Human Resources Department:** Add (1) Division Manager. **Delete** (1) Human Resources Analyst and (1) Administrative Specialist
- c) **Department of Public Services:** Add (8) Municipal Workers (TROD)
- d) **Recreation Department:** Add (1) Parks/Recreation Programming Coordinator (Aquatics). **Delete** (1) Community Center Director

The Commission approved these items.

**APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:**

- a) **Appeal Hearing Schedule:**

Name	Scheduled for:
David Johnson	Continuance Requested by Appellant's Representative. To be Re-scheduled
Richard Johnson	Coordinating Hearing Meeting Date
Phillip Jones	Continuance Requested/Coordinating New Hearing Date
Robert DeBonis	Subpoenaed Documents Delivered to Appellant
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Department Update: Awaiting Criminal Case Decision

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item and requested follow-up regarding the hearing schedule.

**Request from Banita Bell, Food Service Helper, for an appeal hearing date regarding her termination from the Board of Education.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. The Commission heard the request and granted an appeal hearing date to be scheduled by Civil Service staff and communicated to all parties concerned. Notice of a hearing date will be provided.

**APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:**

**Request from Andrew Melchers to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Graphic Designer (Non-Competitive) selection process.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Ms. Doris Adotey, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Latha Venkata Krishnan to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Senior Sanitarian.** The candidate was present at the meeting to and offered additional information relating to the request. Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Orlando Byrden to appeal the rejection of his application for the Electrical Maintenance Helper exam.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Stephanie Baggett to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Assistant Parking Service Supervisor.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Suzanna Carter to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Accountant.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Ms. Ornita Brown, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from LaRita Cornett to appeal the rejection of her application for the position of Senior Accounting Technician.** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Matthew Taylor to appeal his disqualification from the Police Officer-Lateral Entry process.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Police Specialist, Doug Perkins represented the City's Police Department. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from David Scott to appeal his disqualification from the Police Officer-Lateral Entry process.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information relating to the request. Police Specialist, Doug Perkins represented the City's Police Department. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department, was also present. Based upon the additional information provided by the candidate, the Commission approved Mr. Scott's re-instatement into the Police Officer-Lateral Entry Process.



**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:**

- a) **Update on the City's Pending Reorganization of the Department of Planning and Buildings and the Department of Trade and Development.** The Commission noted this item.
- b) **The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5.** The Commission noted this item. CODE Representative, Niroshan Wijesooriya, of Minnillo & Jenkins Co. LPA, Attorneys at Law, was present at the meeting. Mr. Wijesooriya declined to address any agenda items. Mr. Wijesooriya was invited to approach the table by Commissioner McNeal. Mr. Wijesooriya stated that he had no agenda items to address and that he was present as an observer. Mr. Wijesooriya stated that he wanted to share that CODE was involved in a dispute with the City and CODE in regards to the creation of new classification specifications and that the City had filed a request for clarification with the State Employee Relations Board.

**ADDED ITEM:**

The Civil Service Commission has responded to CODE's inquiry from the December 10, 2014 Civil Service Meeting and the Commission's letter of response was delivered to CODE's legal representatives via U.S. mail.